

COMMITTEE REPORT

Date: 21 October 2010 **Ward:** Guildhall
Team: West/Centre Area **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel

Reference: 10/00622/LBC
Application at: Stable Block Chapter House Street York
For: Conversion of coach house to provide a single dwelling house.
By: Mr John Edwards
Application Type: Listed Building Consent
Target Date: 7 June 2010
Recommendation: Delegated Authority to Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 An application for listed building consent for the conversion of the coach house at Gray's Court was presented to Members at the West/ Centre Planning Sub-Committee on 18 September 2010. The application was deferred to allow the applicant to amend the scheme to address the following concerns as expressed in the previous recommendations-

"The proposed external alterations to the building including the size and number of rooflights, the introduction of solar panels, the erection of a porch, the vertical emphasis of new windows and doors and consequential loss of the more generously proportioned openings, and the loss of characteristic features such as the stable doors and taking-in hatches would adversely affect the utilitarian character of the building and harm the appearance of the building. As such the proposals would not meet the objectives of policies HE4 of the Development Control Local Plan or of policies contained within Planning Policy Statement 5 "Planning for the Historic Environment".

1.2 The officer's previous committee report is attached as Appendix 1.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF

City Boundary GMS Constraints: York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams GMS Constraints: Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 1; 1 Grays Court Chapter House Street York 0723

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; 4 Chapter House Street York YO1 2JH 0726

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 1; City Walls Bootham Bar To Monk Bar 0577

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; 6 Chapter House Street York YO1 2JH 0725

Scheduled Ancient Monuments GMS Constraints: SMR 13280 York Minster Precinct Inc. Section Of City Walls

Schools GMS Constraints: St. Wilfrid's RC Primary 0230

2.2 Policies:

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

CYHE11
Trees and landscape

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

The following additional responses were received from internal consultees following consultation with the revised proposals-

Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development (Conservation Architect)- No objections subject to conditions.

3.2 EXTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

A re-consultation exercise has been carried out following receipt of the revised plans. The consultation period expires on 27 October 2010. Members will be updated of any responses that have been received to the date of the meeting.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 KEY ISSUES

- Visual impact on the setting of the listed building as a result of the revised details

4.2 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

See previous report

ASSESSMENT

4.3 The scheme for conversion of the building into a single dwelling house has been revised in accordance with advice set out in the Historic Environment Planning Practice Guide (PPS5 Planning for the Historic Environment), in particular paragraphs 185 & 186 which concern alterations to new openings (including roof lights) when buildings are being converted to new uses.

4.4 The existing building has a contrived utilitarian ground floor with an upper floor with a domestic appearance. It is considered that any alterations to the building should not over-domesticate the character of the building and retain as much of its utilitarian character on the ground floor as possible.

4.5 The proposed revisions relate to Drawing No. GC1/02/03 rev D and are outlined as follows:

ROOFLIGHTS-

- 1) two roof lights have been omitted on plan from the rear slope
- 2) the size of all roof lights has been reduced as they either serve bathrooms or give additional light to secondary spaces
- 3) the front roof light has been relocated to correspond with the otherwise unlit internal lobby

SOLAR PANELS-

- 4) solar panels have been retained on the rear slope and a condition should be attached requiring final agreement on size, type and assembly subject to calculations

OPENINGS-

- 5) the poor quality mid C20th ground floor window on the SE elevation has been amended to reflect the window on the gable facing the City Walls (9) Accordingly a typical brick arch opening has been introduced.
- 6) A stable door format has been retained for the former stable door (16)
- 7) the continuous timber lintols have been retained
- 8) new ground floor windows/doors have been designed to be more consistent with each other
- 9) larger section framing has been used with glazed panels of squarer proportions to better reflect the utilitarian nature of previous openings

PORCH-

- 10) the porch has not been removed for two reasons: there is limited head room on the upper floor and therefore equipment served by the solar panels will need to be located on the ground floor; the porch would allow more space within the entrance corridor and enable the wide internal stable door opening to be retained. The revised design for the entrance door and side screens is bolder in appearance to be consistent with other revised openings. It is now considered that the justification for the porch outweighs the harm. It is also a reversible addition.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 On balance it is considered that the alterations to the building would be a significant improvement to a former service building, would allow the building to be re-used, whilst retaining the generosity of proportion and solidity of form that is a feature of the building.

5.2 Members are requested that officers are granted delegated authority to approve the application if there are no further objections which raise new issues as a result of the re-consultation exercise.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Delegated Authority to Approve

1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans and other submitted details:-

Drawing No. GC1/02/03 Revision D, Received 11 October 2010

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the following details shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority and thereafter the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

(i) Large scale details and a schedule of new windows, doors and screens (internal and external). Details of any typical joinery elements shall be drawn at 1:20 and 1:5. The opening context (lintols, reveals, cills, thresholds) and set-backs shall also be specified.

(ii) Manufacturer's literature of the rooflights and solar panels. Maximum dimensions of both shall be specified and a section shall be provided showing the relationship between the solar panels and the slate covering.

(iii) Large scale of the porch, showing eaves and verge conditions and the relationship between new brickwork and framing. The porch shall not be toothed-in to the existing wall.

(iv) Large scale details of the new external boarding, showing its relationship with existing lintols and wall face

(v) Measures for upgrading acoustic or thermal performance of the fabric shall be specified. Drawings shall be submitted illustrating any changes.

(vi) A schedule of the proposed repairs. Any repairs and "making good" works shall be carried out to a high standard in materials and methods matching those of the original building

(vii) Samples of any new external building and landscaping materials

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details and in the interests of the special significance of the listed building.

4. All new rooflights shall be 'conservation' type rooflights. Prior to commencement of development hereby permitted, the design, type and manufacturer's details of the rooflights shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The rooflights shall be inserted in accordance with the approved details and thereafter be so retained.

Reason: To achieve a visually acceptable form of development.

5. Brick infill panels shall maintain straight-through joints on the exterior of the building and new mortar in the panels shall match existing

Reason: To achieve a visually acceptable form of development.

6. New partitions shall be scribed around existing details

Reason: Reason: In the interests of the visual amenity and historical and architectural interest of the Listed Building.

7. A level 1 photographic recording should be undertaken describing the building inside and outside as found, in accordance with English Heritage guidance "Understanding Historic Buildings: A guide to good recording practice" published 2006.

Reason: In order to deposit a permanent record of this part of the Listed Building in an established archive in the interests of its understanding which will provide an informed approach to future development at the Listed Building.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the special historic interests of the listed buildings. As such the proposal complies with Policies HE4 and HE11 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan- Incorporating the Proposed 4th Set of Changes and related national guidance contained in Planning Policy Guidance Note No. 15 "Planning and the Historic Environment."

Contact details:

Author: Fiona Mackay Development Management Officer (Wed - Fri)

Tel No: 01904 552407